

Atlantic States Marine Fisheries Commission

Atlantic Menhaden Management Board

February 20, 2013

8:00 – 9:45 a.m.

Alexandria, VA

Draft Agenda

The times listed are approximate; the order in which these items will be taken is subject to change; other items may be added as necessary.

1. Welcome/Call to Order (*L. Daniel*) 8:00 a.m.
2. Board Consent 8:05 a.m.
 - Approval of Agenda
 - Approval of Proceedings from December 2012
3. Public Comment 8:10 a.m.
4. Technical Committee Report (*J. Brust*) 8:15 a.m.
5. Discuss Amendment 2 Implementation and Compliance (*L. Daniel*) 8:30 a.m.
 - Total Allowable Catch Set Aside for Episodic Events (*M. Waine*)
 - Update on Compliance Requirements (*M. Waine*)
6. Multispecies Technical Committee Report on Progress of Ecological Reference Points (*M. Cieri*) 9:10 a.m.
7. Review and Populate the Stock Assessment Subcommittee (*M. Waine*) 9:35 a.m.
Action
8. Review and Populate the Plan Review Team (*M. Waine*) **Action** 9:40 a.m.
9. Other Business/Adjourn 9:45 a.m.

The meeting will be held at the Crown Plaza, 901 North Fairfax Street, Alexandria, VA 22314; 703-683-6000

MEETING OVERVIEW

Atlantic Menhaden Management Board Meeting
Wednesday, February 20, 2013
8:00 – 9:45 a.m.
Alexandria, Virginia

Chair: Louis Daniel (NC) Assumed Chairmanship: 3/11	Technical Committee Chair: Jeff Brust (NJ)	Law Enforcement Committee Representative: Lloyd Ingerson (MD)
Vice Chair: Robert Boyles	Advisory Panel Chair: William Windley (MD)	Previous Board Meeting: December 14, 2012
Voting Members: ME, NH, MA, RI, CT, NY, NJ, DE, MD, PRFC, VA, NC, SC, GA, FL, NMFS, USFWS (17 votes)		

2. Board Consent

- Approval of Agenda
- Approval of Proceedings from December 14, 2012

3. Public Comment – At the beginning of the meeting public comment will be taken on items not on the agenda. Individuals that wish to speak at this time must sign-in at the beginning of the meeting. For agenda items that have already gone out for public hearing and/or have had a public comment period that has closed, the Board Chair may determine that additional public comment will not provide additional information. In this circumstance the Chair will not allow additional public comment on an issue. For agenda items that the public has not had a chance to provide input, the Board Chair may allow limited opportunity for comment. The Board Chair has the discretion to limit the number of speakers and/or the length of each comment.

4. Technical Committee Report (8:15 – 8:30 a.m.)

Background

- The Technical Committee reviewed stock status relative to the new biomass reference points, and discussed the development of fixed gear abundance indices as adopted through Amendment 2 (**Briefing CD**).
- The Technical Committee also reviewed a Stock Assessment Subcommittee Memo requesting funding for data entry of historic tagging data to be used in the 2014 stock assessment (**Briefing CD**).

Presentations

- Technical Committee Report by J. Brust

Board actions for consideration at this meeting

- Considering funding request from Stock Assessment Subcommittee

5. Discuss Amendment 2 Implementation and Compliance (8:30 – 9:10 a.m.)

Background

- The Board approved Amendment 2 to the FMP for Atlantic Menhaden at their December 2012 meeting and needs to discuss implementation and compliance with the newly approved Amendment (**Supplemental Materials**).
- The Board needs to review the Total Allowable Catch Set Aside for Episodic Events to clarify the process and implementation of this management option (**Supplemental Materials**).

Presentations

- Update on Compliance Requirements by M. Waine

6. Multispecies Technical Committee Report on Progress of ERPs (9:10 – 9:35 a.m.)**Background**

- The Multispecies Technical Committee has continued to explore the development of Ecosystem Based Reference Points and will present a progress report to the Board.

Presentations

- Multispecies Technical Committee Report by M. Cieri

7. Stock Assessment Subcommittee Membership (9:35 -9:40 a.m.) Action**Background**

- In preparation for the 2014 benchmark stock assessment the following Stock Assessment Subcommittee Membership is under review.

Dr. Matt Cieri, Maine Department of Marine Resources

Dr. Robert Latour, Virginia Institute of Marine Science

Mr. Micah Dean, Massachusetts Division of Marine Fisheries

Dr. Behzad Mahmoudi, Florida Fish and Wildlife Research Institute

Mr. Jason McNamee, Department of Environmental Management Marine Fisheries Section

Dr. Geneviève Nesslage, Atlantic States Marine Fisheries Commission

Dr. Amy Schueller, National Marine Fisheries Service

Dr. Alexei Sharov, Maryland Department of Natural Resources

Mr. Joseph Smith, National Marine Fisheries Service

Presentations

- Review membership by M. Waine

Board actions for consideration at this meeting

- Approve membership.

8. Plan Review Team Membership (9:40 -9:45a.m.) Action**Background**

- To prepare for the implementation and tracking with Amendment 2, the Plan Review Team Membership is under review.

Ellen Cosby, Potomac River Fisheries Commission

Steve Meyers, National Marine Fisheries Service

Trish Murphey, North Carolina Division of Marine Fisheries

Michael Waine, Atlantic States Marine Fisheries Commission, Chair

Presentations

- Review membership by M. Waine

Board actions for consideration at this meeting

- Approve membership

9. Other Business/Adjourn



Atlantic States Marine Fisheries Commission

1050 N. Highland Street • Suite 200A-N • Arlington, VA 22201
703.842.0740 • 703.842.0741 (fax) • www.asmfc.org

MEMORANDUM

TO: Atlantic Menhaden Management Board
FROM: Atlantic Menhaden Technical Committee
RE: Technical Committee Report for February 2013 Board Meeting
DATE: February 1, 2013

The Atlantic Menhaden Technical Committee met by conference call on January 25, 2013 to discuss three items of relevance to the Management Board for their February 2013 meeting. These include:

1. Stock status determination relative to the new biomass reference points adopted under Amendment 2
2. Funding request for data entry of historic tagging data to be used in the 2014 benchmark stock assessment
3. Development of fixed gear abundance indices as required under Amendment 2

Stock status determination

Addendum 5 (November 2011) to the Menhaden Fishery Management plan redefined fishing mortality reference points from values based on median recruitment (F_{rep} and $F_{rep.thresh}$) to values based on percent of maximum spawning potential ($F_{30\%MSP}$ and $F_{15\%MSP}$). Reference points for biomass were not changed through Addendum 5 and remained in terms of median recruitment (SSB_{rep} and $SSB_{rep.thresh}$). The Technical Committee recognized the inconsistency and recommended to the Board that F and biomass reference points should be based on consistent criteria. In December 2012, the Board passed Amendment 2 to the FMP which, among other things, redefined biomass reference points for the stock based on percent maximum spawning potential ($SSB_{30\%MSP}$ and $SSB_{15\%MSP}$). It is therefore necessary to evaluate stock status relative to the new reference point values.

The new biomass reference points, based on the 2012 stock assessment update, are $SSB_{target} = SSB_{30\%} = 61,100$ and $SSB_{threshold} = SSB_{15\%} = 30,551$ (units are billions of ova). The terminal year estimate of SSB from the 2012 stock assessment base run is approximately 44% of the SSB threshold. In addition, four sensitivity runs estimated terminal year SSB as 41 to 48% of the threshold value. However, one sensitivity run indicated that terminal year SSB was 120% of the threshold value. In other words, the base run and four sensitivity runs indicate the stock is overfished, while one sensitivity run indicates that the stock is not overfished. The Technical Committee concluded that there was not sufficient evidence to determine overfished status. There was discussion that five of six runs indicated the stock was overfished, which might provide support for this status determination. However, these five runs all employed a flat-top fishery selectivity curve, while the final run employed dome-shaped selectivity. There has been a great deal of attention surrounding the appropriate selectivity pattern recently, and without conclusive evidence regarding the shape of selectivity, the Technical Committee reached consensus that the number of runs in favor of a given status was not an indicator of its validity. The Technical Committee will investigate the effects of the selectivity curve shape during the 2014 benchmark stock assessment, but until then, the overfished status of the Atlantic menhaden stock

remains uncertain. The Technical Committee previously determined that overfishing is occurring relative to the MSP-based fishing mortality reference points.

Funding request for data entry of historic tagging data

The stock assessment subcommittee has identified a data source that will help fill data gaps on the migratory patterns of menhaden and selectivity patterns of the fishery, as well as provide information to estimate natural and fishing mortality rates. Unfortunately, the data are only available in paper format and must be key entered in the short-term if they are to be available for use in the 2014 stock assessment. Attachment 1 (SAS memo and quote) details the scope of work and funding requirements to complete this work in a timely manner. The TC stresses that this is the only known source of data that can inform Atlantic menhaden migratory patterns and fishery selectivity. It is therefore imperative that this project get funding in the very near term if the SAS is to develop a scientifically-defensible, spatially-explicit stock assessment model. A spatially-explicit model without this information is possible, but without these data the spatial component would be based on conjecture and would likely not pass peer review. The TC therefore strongly recommends that the Board approve funding for this project.

Development of adult fixed-gear indices

One of the requirements of Amendment 2 is for states to develop CPUE indices of adults from their fixed gear fisheries to supplement the current PRFC pound net index. The Technical Committee discussed the types of data necessary and the appropriate analytical methods to develop these indices. It was determined that the methodology used for the PRFC index should be considered the “minimum standard” which others should emulate. However, to fully evaluate this task, it was determined that states should identify all potential sources of data, both fishery dependent and fishery independent, and the TC will evaluate these and make recommendations on data collection and analysis during a meeting later this spring. The TC acknowledges the Board’s willingness to implement data requirements to enhance the development of an adult abundance index through Amendment 2 and will work to achieve that goal.



Atlantic States Marine Fisheries Commission

1050 N. Highland Street • Suite 200A-N • Arlington, VA 22201
703.842.0740 • 703.842.0741 (fax) • www.asmfc.org

MEMORANDUM

TO: Atlantic Menhaden Management Board

FROM: Atlantic Menhaden Stock Assessment Subcommittee

RE: Funds requested for key entry of Atlantic menhaden tagging data

DATE: February 1, 2013

During the 2010 benchmark stock assessment for Atlantic menhaden, one peer review recommendation was to create an area-specific stock assessment model that would take into account the species' migratory behavior and the differences between the Chesapeake Bay fishery (which catches younger and smaller fish) and the Mid- and North Atlantic fisheries (which catch older and larger fish). In order to approach the task of creating a spatially-explicit model, data are required on menhaden movements. At present, there are no electronic data available to address this data gap. However, data from a historical tagging study are available in paper format and are housed at the NMFS Beaufort Laboratory.

The historical tagging data contain information about both release and recovery of adult Atlantic menhaden during 1966 to 1970. These data would provide vital information on menhaden movement that would inform a spatially-explicit stock assessment model. In addition, these data will likely provide information on survival and natural mortality independent of the data and models currently used in the assessment. Some publications already exist that are based on these tagging data; however, the publications do not include all years of the available data and methods for analyzing these types of data have improved substantially since the data were collected and published.

The Atlantic Menhaden Stock Assessment Subcommittee (SAS) is committed to analyzing these historical tagging data if they were available in a readily accessible format. Thus, the obstacle at this point is having the data key entered into electronic files. The SAS is requesting funds for key entry of the available tagging data to provide movement and mortality information for the upcoming 2014 benchmark assessment. A quote of \$35,000 was provided by SC Data in Raleigh, NC, in winter 2013. An estimated 1.02 million fish were marked with 180,000 recoveries at fish plants ranging from Florida to New York. In addition, another 75,000 records exist that would provide information on efficiency of tag recovery within plants. Please see the quote attached. In order for the data to be available and analyzed for the 2014 benchmark Atlantic menhaden assessment, the data would need to be key entered by August 2013, which means that funding for the key entry task is needed by March 2013. These tagging data are critical if a spatially-explicit model that accounts for menhaden migration is to be considered during the 2014 benchmark assessment..



SC DATA INC.

2200 New Bern Ave. / Raleigh, North Carolina 27610 / (919) 231-8994

January 8, 2013

NOAA, National Marine Fisheries Service
Attn: Joseph Smith
101 Pivers Island Road
Beaufort, NC 28516

Dear Joe,

I would like to thank you for giving SC Data Inc. the opportunity to place a quote on the data entry of the Menhaden Tagging Data.

The following is SC Data Inc.'s cost quote for the Menhaden Tagging Data project:

Punching and Verification of 180,000 records @ \$0.19 per record = \$34,200.00

The above cost includes the setting up of all data entry screens and the programming of the fields for the entering of the data, along with the data entry and verification of the records.

If I can be of any further assistance or should any concerns arise, please do not hesitate to call or email.

Sincerely,

Pat Bailey
Customer Support Manager
919-231-8994 x 125
patbailey@scdainc.com



Atlantic States Marine Fisheries Commission

1050 N. Highland Street • Suite 200A-N • Arlington, VA 22201
703.842.0740 • 703.842.0741 (fax) • www.asmf.org

MEMORANDUM

TO: Atlantic Menhaden Management Board

FROM: Michael Waine, FMP Coordinator

RE: Atlantic Menhaden Stock Assessment Subcommittee and Plan Review Team Memberships

DATE: February 1, 2013

Atlantic Menhaden Stock Assessment Subcommittee Membership

The Atlantic Menhaden Stock Assessment Subcommittee (SAS) membership needs to be reviewed in preparation for the development and completion of the benchmark stock assessment scheduled for review in 2014. The following members are currently appointed to the SAS,

Dr. Matt Cieri, Maine Department of Marine Resources
Dr. Robert Latour, Virginia Institute of Marine Science
Mr. Micah Dean, Massachusetts Division of Marine Fisheries
Dr. Behzad Mahmoudi, Florida Fish and Wildlife Research Institute
Mr. Jason McNamee, Department of Environmental Management Marine Fisheries Section
Dr. Geneviève Nessler, Atlantic States Marine Fisheries Commission
Dr. Amy Schueller, National Marine Fisheries Service
Dr. Alexei Sharov, Maryland Department of Natural Resources
Mr. Joseph Smith, National Marine Fisheries Service

The following text describes the procedure for populating a SAS.

Upon the request of a Management board/Section, the TC shall nominate individuals with appropriate expertise in stock assessment and fish population dynamics to a Species Stock Assessment Subcommittee (SAS), which will report to the Technical Committee. SAS nominations are approved by the Management board/section and shall continue in existence as long as the Management board/section requires. Membership of a Species Stock Assessment Subcommittee will be comprised of Technical Committee members with appropriate knowledge and experience in stock assessment and biology of the species being assessed. Individuals from outside the TC with expertise in stock assessment or biology of the species may also be nominated and appointed, if necessary. The Technical Committee chair will serve as an ex-officio member of the Species Stock Assessment Subcommittee. Overall membership should be kept to a maximum of six persons unless additional analytical expertise is requested by the Technical Committee or Species Stock Assessment Subcommittee.

Atlantic Menhaden Plan Review Team Membership

The Atlantic Menhaden Plan Review Team (PRT) membership needs to be reviewed and repopulated to assist in tracking the implementation and compliance with Amendment 2. The following members were previously appointed to the PRT,

Ellen Cosby, Potomac River Fisheries Commission

Steve Meyers, National Marine Fisheries Service

Trish Murphey, North Carolina Division of Marine Fisheries

Michael Wayne, Atlantic States Marine Fisheries Commission, Chair

The following text describes the procedure for populating a PRT.

The PRT shall be appointed by the management boards/sections to review regulations and compliance. Members should be knowledgeable concerning the scientific data, stock and fishery condition, and fishery management issues. The PRT shall generally be kept to a maximum of six persons.